

---

MEETING	ECONOMIC & CITY DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE	8 DECEMBER 2009
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS PIERCE (CHAIR), HUDSON (VICE-CHAIR), D'AGORNE, HYMAN, KIRK, POTTER AND SCOTT
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR HOLVEY

---

## **24. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor Hyman declared a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda item 11 (Work Plan 2009/10) as the Council's representative on the Board of [york-england.com](http://york-england.com).

Councillor D'Agorne declared a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda item 6 (Councillor Call for Action in relation to maintenance, parking and safety issues at Broadway shops) as Ward Member and as the shops were close to his home.

Councillor Kirk declared a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda item 8 (Interim Report of the Water End Task Group) as she was employed by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation whose premises were close to Water End.

## **25. MINUTES**

Arising out of consideration of the minutes it was reported that the Executive Member for City Strategy would be considering a report on the Westminster Road area consultation and survey results at his Decision Session on 5 January 2010.

In relation to the report to the meeting on the Economic Development Programme it was reported that a pre Council Seminar from Science City York had been held on 15 October 2009. Following this very informative session it had been decided that it would not now be necessary for Science City to address the Committee on the economic development of the city (Minute 22 (ii) refers). It was agreed that the information provided by Cllr D'Agorne to the meeting on 29 September should be forwarded to the Economic Development Unit.<sup>1</sup>

**RESOLVED:** That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 29 September 2009 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record subject to the following amendment:

In resolution i) of Minute 19 the deletion of the word 'appeased' and its replacement with 'resolved'.

### Action Required

1. Forward information to EDU.

TW

## **26. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

It was reported that there had been one registration to speak under the Council's Public Participation Scheme from Doris Fewster as Chair of Broadway Area Good Neighbour and Residents' Association (BAGNARA) in relation to Agenda item 6 (Feasibility and Assessment Report – Councillor Call for Action in relation to maintenance, parking and safety issues at Broadway Shops).

Mrs Fewster stated that she wished to let Members know the views of the community in relation to problems encountered by residents in visiting this parade of shops. She confirmed that parking and safety problems had existed here for a number of years but that recently parking had become much worse. She stated that following the closure of a number of Post Offices this had increased usage of the Broadway branch and that residents with prams, young children, buggies and shopping trolleys were finding it increasing difficult to manoeuvre around parked vehicles. Reversing of vehicles and bad sight lines resulting from parked vehicles were also hazardous to pedestrians.

## **27. 2009/10 FINANCE AND PERFORMANCE MONITOR 2 REPORT**

The Committee considered a report, which provided details of the 2009/10 forecast outturn position for both finance and performance in City Strategy, Housing Services.

The following outturn positions were reported:

- City Strategy Directorate – projected overspend of £+239k on a total net budget of £7.8m
- Housing General Fund – projected overspend of £+52k on a net budget of £1,407k

Officers updated that scrutiny of Licensing and Regulation Services now fell within the Community Safety Overview and Scrutiny Committee's remit. It was also reported that the additional costs involved in issuing bus tokens and bus pass reimbursements would reduce from 1 December with the introduction of a revised reimbursement rate by the North Yorkshire Concessionary Fare partnership. It was indicated that preliminary notice of the Housing and Planning Delivery Grant was lower than had been expected, although the reasons for this were unclear at the present time.

Members questioned and commented on the following aspects of the report:

- Breakdown of road traffic accidents between cars and motorcycles and whether the reduction in accidents related to policy initiatives or chance;
- If information was collected on Park and Ride passenger journeys detailing the number of visitors and commuters;
- If there had been any change in car occupancy at the Park and Ride sites;

- Success of York's Car Free Day;
- Cheaper Tuesdays and the increase in pay and park by text;
- Progress with introduction of pay on exit at Piccadilly car park;
- Vacancy management measures and redeployment of staff.

Members thanked all the officers for their comprehensive report and updates.

RESOLVED: That the forecast outturn information report be noted.

REASON: To update the Scrutiny Committee of the latest financial and performance position.

## **28. EXECUTIVE MEMBER FOR CITY STRATEGY**

The Executive Member for City Strategy was in attendance and he presented his report on progress to date and forthcoming priorities in relation to his portfolio.

Members commented on and questioned the following aspects of the report:

- Local Development Framework slippage in relation to the timetable;
- LTP3 and main pressures on the city at the present time;
- York Central and the bid for consideration as an Accelerated Development Zone;
- Progress towards achieving air quality objectives;
- Details of the City Region Urban Eco Settlement proposal on the York Northwest site;
- Details of the York Renaissance Team as 'lead companion' involved in major developments in the city;
- Whether the reductions in CO<sub>2</sub> emissions were related to the decline in manufacturing industries in the city.

Members thanked Councillor Galloway for his detailed report and updates.

## **29. FEASIBILITY AND ASSESSMENT REPORT - COUNCILLOR CALL FOR ACTION (CCfA) IN RELATION TO MAINTENANCE, PARKING AND SAFETY ISSUES AT BROADWAY SHOPS.**

Consideration was given to a report which asked Members to consider a Councillor Call for Action (CCfA) submitted by Councillors D'Agorne and Taylor in relation to maintenance, parking and safety issues at Broadway shops in Fishergate Ward. A copy of the registration form had been attached to the report at Annex A.

Details of work undertaken in an effort to resolve the safety issues being experienced at the shops was also set out in the report. Officers confirmed that they had been aware of problems in the area since 2004. They stated that improvements for public safety were difficult due to the fact that the shop forecourts and access road were on private land. The only works that the Local Authority could therefore undertake were emergency works.

Councillor D'Agorne pointed out that it was important that the authority encouraged the engagement of all parties and arranged a collective meeting with all shopkeepers. He confirmed that this was a safety issue on private land which was in a number of different ownerships although some shop owners displayed A boards and planters in front of their premises to provide a clear path for pedestrians.

The Scrutiny Officer circulated photographs, provided by BAGNARA, which illustrated the problems being experienced.

Members considered the following options that were open to them:

- Option A      Proceed with the CCfA and progress this topic to review
- Option B      Suggest alternative avenues that could be explored by the Ward Councillors to assist with resolving the current issues i.e. a round table discussion between all parties
- Option C      Do not progress the topic to review

Members stated that it appeared all reasonable options had been exhausted and that the Committee should lend their support to arranging a meeting with all parties in an effort to resolve the current issues. It was also suggested that a timescale should be included but that proceeding with the CCfA and progressing the topic to review would still be an option should no suitable resolution be found.

RESOLVED:            That, in the first instance, and in order to offer some support from Scrutiny, Members of the Committee agree to proceed with Option B of the report, and arrange to facilitate a round table discussion between all willing parties with a report back to the Committee in March 2010. <sup>1</sup>.

REASON:              To address the concerns raised in this CCfA in light of the difficulties pertaining to private land ownership and the Council's legal status in relation to this.

Action Required

1. Arrange meeting with all willing parties.

TW

**30. OPEN LETTER FROM MEMBERS OF THE YORK ENVIRONMENT FORUM**

The Chair of the York Environment Forum (YEF) was in attendance to present an open letter on behalf of members of the York Environment Forum to the Committee.

The letter referred to the implementation of the Sustainable Community Strategy and the constructive role the YEF had played in its implementation yet documents and policies appeared to ignore the Forums contribution. He pointed out that the Forum now felt it necessary to raise issue with the Prioritising Prosperity report prepared for the Council by the

Centre for Cities. He stated that the Forum had a number of reservations about the analysis and they hoped that the future of the city would be addressed in true partnership.

He stated that in the developing world, where there was a cycle of endless growth and material consumption, that it was impossible for this to continue. There was a need for a real debate, at a local level, for the introduction of measures in relation to the use of resources to prevent damage to the environment. He asked Members to take these issues on board and endeavour to address them in the future.

Members acknowledged the issues raised by the Forum and supported the need for debate and wider discussions. They agreed that the Scrutiny Committee had a role in facilitating discussion but pointed out that York was a small city which made it difficult to affect change without partnership working. Members also pointed out that consideration should be given to the YEF's points when future reports were commissioned and that these should incorporate an analysis of how the content improved sustainability.

Officers confirmed that the YEF's open letter was to be discussed at the Environment Partnership Forum meeting in January. They also referred to ongoing initiatives, meetings and workshops in connection with the environmental concerns raised.

The Chair then thanked Jonathan Tyler the Chair of the Forum for his attendance and frank presentation, which he confirmed Members had noted.

### **31. INTERIM REPORT OF THE WATER END TASK GROUP**

The Committee considered a report which presented a draft extended scope and timetable for the Water End review. Background information and work undertaken by the Task Group to date was also detailed.

Officers reported that the Task Group's next meeting was on 15 December 2009 during which they would receive background information in relation to previous reports to the Executive Member for City Strategy regarding the proposed improvements for cyclists and technical information in relation to the Water End junction proposals.

RESOLVED: That the Committee:

- i) Approve the draft extended scope and timetable at paragraph 4 of the report subject to the addition of "and the policy implications of such actions, if any" after the word "layout" at the end of point (iii) 15.12.2009.
- ii) Note the work undertaken by the Task Group to date.

REASON: In order to progress this review.

## **32. SCOPING REPORT - NEWGATE MARKET**

Consideration was given to a report, which provided information to the Committee prior to the proposed commencement of a new scrutiny review on Newgate Market. It also asked for approval and or amendment to the remit and scope of this review.

Members were asked to approve and or amend the draft remit and scope set out in paragraphs 13, 14 & 15 of this report and to consider whether they wished to form a task group to undertake the review.

Members expressed support for the remit and scope subject to the remit being extended to include an examination of the market and the surrounding area. They also considered whether the review should be undertaken by the full Committee or a Task Group.

RESOLVED:           i)       That the Committee approve the draft remit and scope set out in paragraphs 13,14 and 15 of the report subject to the following amended aim of the remit:

To investigate possible ways of improving the existing stall market and the surrounding area currently occupied by Newgate Market ~~to input~~ *as contribution to* the Renaissance Team's work and the Footstreets Review, enabling them to recommend new designs and roles for Newgate Market and the associated public realm.

ii)       That the work associated with this review be undertaken by the full Scrutiny Committee.

REASON:               To enable the review to progress.

*[As amended at the Committee's meeting held on 26 January 2010]*

## **33. FEASIBILITY STUDY - SAFE TRAVEL TO SCHOOL**

Members considered a feasibility study regarding a scrutiny topic on 'physical access to schools across the city with specific reference to school travel plans, the speed of traffic, illegal parking, effectiveness of crossings and surface of roads and pavements'.

Councillor Alexander had originally registered the topic at the end of 2008 at which time he had been advised to await the outcome of the Traffic Congestion Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee. He had now examined the draft report of this Committee and was not satisfied that the issues he had raised had been covered.

Councillor Alexander, who was in attendance for consideration of this item, referred to various problems in relation to speeding vehicles, parking, road surfacing and visibility at the following Primary Schools in his Ward:

- Acomb
- St Barnabas'
- English Martyrs'
- St Paul's and
- Poppleton Road

He agreed that it appeared a wide topic but pointed out that he was sure that the problems encountered were not just centred on his Ward. He pointed out that many School Travel Plans were out of date and that parents were often unaware of them.

Officers confirmed that similar concerns had been raised by Members and local residents throughout the authority's area. He pointed out that not all schools had Travel Plans and that assessments had been undertaken and measures put in place to provide safe routes to schools but this did not take into account inconsiderate parking.

Members confirmed that they had encountered similar problems in their Wards and they felt that a presentation would be beneficial to enable them to gain a better understanding of the issues involved.

Members were asked to consider the following options:

Option A      Progress the topic to review

Option B      Receive a presentation on the Safe Routes to School Programme and School Travel Plans in order to identify whether these could be a focus for a scrutiny review

Option C      Do not progress the topic to review

RESOLVED:      That the Committee agree to undertake Option B as set out in paragraph 7 of the report and to receive a presentation on the Safe Routes to School Programme and School Travel Plans in order to identify whether these could be a focus for a scrutiny review. 1.

REASON:      To address the concerns raised in the topic registration form.

#### Action Required

1. Arrange presentation.

TW

### **34. WORK PLAN 2009/10**

Members considered the Committee's work plan for 2009/10 together with extracts from the Forward Plan related to the Committee's remit.

RESOLVED:      That the Chair and Vice Chair, in consultation with the Scrutiny Officer, be delegated authority to update the Committee's work plan as considered appropriate.

REASON: To assist in the planning of work for this Committee.

**35. ASSISTANT DIRECTOR (CITY DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORT)**

As this would be the last meeting of the Committee attended by Damon Copperthwaite, prior to his retirement in January, the Chair expressed the Committee's appreciation for his contributions and work with the Committee and its members.

CLLR R PIERCE, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 7.35 pm].